



**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA**

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS No. 11**

**THIRD SESSION, FORTY-FIRST LEGISLATURE**

**PRAYER**

**1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.**

Immediately following the Prayer, Hon. Mr. FLETCHER rose on a Matter of Privilege regarding Independent Members' right to speak in debate and moved:

THAT the Rules Committee be convened to make recommendations to improve the Rules of the Manitoba Legislature and Standing Committees.

WHEREUPON Madam Speaker ruled as follows:

The Honourable Member for Assiniboia is reflecting on the authority of the Speaker. The Member has previously raised a number of points of order and matters of privilege on the topic of the rights of independent Members in the House. On October 11, 2017 he raised two points of order on this topic, and on October 24th, 2017 he raised a matter of privilege in a similar vein.

In each instance the Member claimed that Independent Members were not being allowed to participate fully in debates in this House.

On each of those occasions I have informed the Member that, following the rules and practices of this Assembly, House arrangements such as the order of questions in Question Period and the rotation of speakers in debate are matters governed by agreements between the House Leaders. The current arrangements in the House are in fact the result of exactly that process, and as such are valid and enforceable by the Speaker.

I would note for the Member's reference Beauséne citation 77: "Freedom of speech does not mean that Members have an unlimited or unrestrained right to speak on every issue. The rules of the House impose limits on the participation of Members and it is the duty of the Speaker to restrain those who abuse the rules."

Further, O'Brien and Bosc note on page 100 of House of Commons Procedure and Practice that a "limitation on the freedom of speech of Members is provided by the authority of the Speaker under the Standing Orders to preserve order and decorum, and when necessary to order a Member to resume his or her seat if engaged in irrelevance or repetition in debate, or to name a Member for disregarding the authority of the Chair and order him or her to withdraw".

I am aware that the Member is unsatisfied by the current arrangements governing Question Period and debates in the House. I am also aware that the Member has been advised more than once that if he wishes to see any of these arrangements altered he should put his concerns in writing to the House Leaders and offer an alternative proposal.

Accordingly, I am instructing the Honourable Member for Assiniboia to cease raising this matter in the House, either as a point of order or a matter of privilege, as he has been given ample instruction and guidance on this topic.

I would also advise the Member that he should not be using points of order to ask procedural questions of the Speaker. If the Member has procedural questions, he should be consulting our Table Officers instead of raising such matters in the House.

If the Member persists in raising this topic here he will be disregarding the authority of the Chair, a circumstance on which I would be obliged to act as Speaker of this House.

---

The following Bills were read a First Time and had their purposes outlined:

(No. 5) – The Public Interest Disclosure (Whistleblower Protection) Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur les divulgations faites dans l'intérêt public (protection des divulgateurs d'actes répréhensibles)

(Hon. Mr. FRIESEN)

(No. 6) – The Public Sector Compensation Disclosure Amendment Act/Loi modifiant la Loi sur la divulgation de la rémunération dans le secteur public

(Hon. Mr. FRIESEN)

---

Hon. Mr. FRIESEN presented:

Report on Fidelity Bonds according to section 20 of The Public Officers Act dated December 6, 2017.

(Sessional Paper No. 10)

---

Hon. Mr. WISHART presented:

Annual Report of the University of Manitoba for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2017

(Sessional Paper No. 11)

Annual Report of the Brandon University for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2017

(Sessional Paper No. 12)

Annual Report of the University of Winnipeg for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2017

(Sessional Paper No. 13)

Annual Report of the Red River College for the year ending June 30, 2017  
(Sessional Paper No. 14)

Annual Report of the Université de Saint-Boniface for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2017  
(Sessional Paper No. 15)

Annual Report of the University College of the North for the year ending June 30, 2017  
(Sessional Paper No. 16)

Annual Report of the Assiniboine Community College for the year ending June 30, 2017  
(Sessional Paper No. 17)

---

Hon. Ms. SQUIRES, the Minister responsible for the Status of Women, made a statement regarding December 6, 2017, being National Day of Remembrance and Action on Violence against Women.

Ms. FONTAINE and, by leave, Ms. LAMOUREUX commented on the statement.

---

Hon. Mr. PEDERSEN, the Minister of Growth, Enterprise and Trade, made a statement regarding Churchill Wild receiving the Transat Sustainable Tourism Award.

Mr. ALLUM and, by leave, Hon. Mr. GERRARD commented on the statement.

---

Pursuant to Rule 27(1), Messrs. BINDLE, SELINGER, TEITSMA and WIEBE and Hon. Mr. FLETCHER made Members' Statements.

---

The following petitions were presented and read:

Mr. KINEW – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients' ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba's public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba's health facilities. (J. Enns, I. Olafson, M. Dushenko and others)

Mr. ALLUM – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients' ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba's public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba's health facilities.

Mr. ALTEMEYER – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients’ ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba’s public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba’s health facilities. (Z. St. Aubin, R. Shand, M. Kelly and others)

Hon. Mr. GERRARD – That the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Minister of Health, Seniors and Active Living to provide an additional 12 Primary Care or Intermediate Care paramedics to facilitate 24/7 coverage at the Grandview ambulance station, to provide a second ambulance vehicle at the Grandview station to allow for deployment to designated geo-positions, to make use of the vacant Manitoba Hydro building as a garage for the two ambulance vehicles and to install a computer based system in the ambulance vehicles to facilitate geo-positioning and dynamic and flexible deployment to any area covered in the proposed plan in this region. (P. Coulombe, J. Coulombe, J. Ironstand and others)

Mr. MARCELINO (Tyndall Park) – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients’ ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba’s public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba’s health facilities. (K. Nicholson, D. Orr, K. Jamieson and others)

Mr. SELINGER – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients’ ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba’s public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba’s health facilities. (R. Mason, M. Zhang, L. Beardy and others)

Ms. MARCELINO (Logan) – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients’ ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba’s public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba’s health facilities.

Mr. LINDSEY – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients’ ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba’s public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba’s health facilities. (R. Everett, N. DeKazel, M. DeKazel and others)

Mr. MALOWAY – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients’ ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba’s public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba’s health facilities. (K. Meaud, M. McMillan, W. Krueger and others)

Mr. WIEBE – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients’ ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba’s public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba’s health facilities.

Ms. FONTAINE – Legislative Assembly of Manitoba to urge the Provincial Government to reverse the cuts and closures that negatively impact patients’ ability access to timely, quality health care and to make real investments in Manitoba’s public health care system that will provide a direct benefit to patients, such as: increasing access to primary care; the development of a provincial health human resource plan; increasing publicly funded personal care homes across Manitoba; and increasing the efficiencies of diagnostic testing in Manitoba’s health facilities. (S. Shaw, K. Popoff, M. Allard and others)

---

Hon. Mr. PEDERSEN moved:

THAT Bill (No. 10) – The Boards, Committees, Councils and Commissions Streamlining Act (Various Acts Amended or Repealed)/Loi sur la simplification des conseils, des comités et des commissions (modification ou abrogation de diverses lois), be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And a debate arising,

And Hon. Mr. PEDERSEN having spoken,

And Mr. ALLUM, Hon. Mr. FLETCHER, Mr. LINDSEY and Hon. Mr. GERRARD having questioned the Minister,

And the debate continuing,

And Mr. ALLUM having spoken,

And Hon. Mr. CULLEN moved:

THAT the debate be now adjourned.

And the Question being put. It was agreed to, on the following division:

**YEA**

BINDLE  
CLARKE  
COX  
CULLEN  
CURRY  
EICHLER  
EWASKO  
FIELDING  
FRIESEN  
GRAYDON  
GUILLEMARD  
HELWER  
ISLEIFSON  
JOHNSON  
JOHNSTON  
LAGASSÉ  
LAGIMODIERE  
MARTIN

MAYER  
MICHALESKI  
MICKLEFIELD  
MORLEY-LECOMTE  
NESBITT  
PEDERSEN  
PIWNIUK  
REYES  
SCHULER  
SMITH (Southdale)  
SMOOK  
SQUIRES  
STEFANSON  
TEITSMA  
WHARTON  
WISHART  
WOWCHUK  
YAKIMOSKI..... 36

**NAY**

ALLUM  
ALTEMEYER  
FLETCHER  
FONTAINE  
GERRARD  
KINEW  
LAMOUREUX

LINDSEY  
MALOWAY  
MARCELINO (Tyndall Park)  
SARAN  
SELINGER  
WIEBE ..... 13

---

The House then adjourned at 5:00 p.m. until 10:00 a.m. Thursday, December 7, 2017.

Hon. Myrna DRIEDGER,  
Speaker.