

Wednesday, April 22, 1998



**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA**

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS** No. 35

**FOURTH SESSION, THIRTY-SIXTH LEGISLATURE**

**PRAYERS**

**1:30 O'CLOCK P.M.**

The following petition was presented:

Mr. EVANS (Interlake) - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (E. Brown, P. Kuypers, M. Pinteau and others)

By leave, the following petition was read and received:

Mr. EVANS (Interlake) - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (R. Colliou, A. Trudeau, N. Gledhill and others)

The following petition was read and received:

Mr. SANTOS - Minister of Health to put an end to the centralization and privatization of Winnipeg hospital food services (M. Lange, C. Pawley, B. Maltman and others)

Mr. LAURENDEAU, Chairperson of the Committee of Supply, reported progress having been made on April 21, 1998. Report was received and the Committee of Supply obtained leave to sit again.

Hon. Mr. McCRAE, the Minister of the Environment made a statement regarding today being the 28th Anniversary of the first Earth Day,

Mr. DEWAR commented on the statement.

**Wednesday, April 22, 1998**

---

Following Oral Questions, Madam Speaker made the following ruling:

On March 26, 1998, the Honourable Member for The Pas brought forward a matter of privilege concerning comments made by the First Minister on March 25 in question period about the Honourable Member for The Pas.

I thank Honourable Members for their advice to the Chair on this matter of privilege.

Although he did not include it in the motion he moved, I think I should make reference to the issue raised by the Honourable Member for The Pas respecting comments he said the Premier apparently made on the Peter Warren radio program. Statements made by a Member outside the House, according to Beauchesne citation 31(3), may not be used as the basis for a question of privilege.

That leaves us with the words spoken by the First Minister on March 25. He said, according to the Hansard record, “. . . rather than stir up discontent and conflict, he ought to get involved in attempting to ensure that the people of Cross Lake come to the table to complete the negotiations. . . .” In raising his matter of privilege, the Honourable Member for The Pas contended what the Premier had said in the House was that if the Honourable Member for The Pas “had not been inciting conflict in Cross Lake, the chief and council and members of Cross Lake would have been to the table to finish negotiating the terms and conditions of the Northern Flood and ready to be implemented.”

Unfortunately, what appears to be in evidence are two interpretations of the words spoken by the Premier. Based on what appears in Hansard, the Honourable Member for The Pas has not made a prima facie case for a matter of privilege. The Member may have had a case for imputation of unworthy motives, but that should have been raised as a point of order.

I would encourage the First Minister, when answering questions, to select his words carefully and to refrain from provoking debate.

From her decision, Mr. ASHTON appealed to the House.

And the Question being put,

“Shall the ruling of the Chair be sustained?”

It was agreed to, on the following division:

CUMMINGS  
DERKACH  
DOWNEY  
DRIEDGER  
DYCK  
ENNS  
FAURSCHOU  
FILMON  
GAUDRY

**YEA**  
McINTOSH (Assiniboia)  
MITCHELSON  
NEWMAN  
..... PENNER  
PITURA  
PRAZNIK  
..... RADCLIFFE  
REIMER  
RENDER

Wednesday, April 22, 1998

---

GILLESHAMMER  
HELWER  
LAURENDEAU  
McALPINE  
McCRAE

ROCAN  
SVEINSON  
TOEWS  
TWEED  
VODREY ..... 28

**NAY**

ASHTON  
BARRETT  
CHOMIAK  
DEWAR  
DOER  
EVANS (Brandon East)  
EVANS (Interlake)  
FRIESEN  
HICKES  
JENNISSEN  
21  
LATHLIN

MACKINTOSH (St. Johns)  
MALOWAY  
MARTINDALE  
MIHYCHUK  
REID  
ROBINSON  
SALE  
SANTOS  
STRUTHERS  
.....WOWCHUK

---

Pursuant to Rule 20(1), Messrs. TWEED, EVANS (Interlake), HELWER, DEWAR and ROBINSON made Members' Statements.

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. FILMON: THAT Bill (No. 3) - The Elections Finances Amendment and Consequential Amendments Act; Loi modifiant la Loi sur le financement des campagnes électorales et modifications corrélatives, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

**Wednesday, April 22, 1998**

---

And Mr. DOER and Ms. BARRETT having spoken,

And the Question being put,

It was agreed to.

The Bill was accordingly read a Second Time and referred to a Committee of this House.

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. CUMMINGS:

THAT Bill (No. 15) - The Dutch Elm Disease Act; Loi sur la graphiose, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And Mr. STRUTHERS, Ms. BARRETT, Mr. LAURENDEAU and Hon. Mr. CUMMINGS having spoken,

And the Question being put,

It was agreed to.

The Bill was accordingly read a Second Time and referred to a Committee of this House.

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. ENNS:

THAT Bill (No. 6) - The Animal Liability and Consequential Amendments Act; Loi sur la responsabilité des propriétaires d'animaux et modifications corrélatives, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And Ms. WOWCHUK having spoken,

The debate was, on motion of Mr. ASHTON, adjourned.

---

**Wednesday, April 22, 1998**

---

The House resumed the Adjourned Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mr. McCRAE:

THAT Bill (No. 17) - The Legislative Assembly Amendment Act; Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'Assemblée législative, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And leave having been denied to have this matter remain in the name of Mr. DEWAR,

And Mr. ASHTON having spoken,

And the Question being put,

It was agreed to.

The Bill was accordingly read a Second Time and referred to a Committee of this House.

---

The House resumed the Interrupted Debate on the Proposed Motion of Hon. Mrs. MITCHELSON:

THAT Bill (No. 4) - The Child and Family Services Amendment and Consequential Amendments Act; Loi modifiant la Loi sur les services à l'enfant et à la famille et modifications corrélatives, be now read a Second Time and be referred to a Committee of this House.

And the debate continuing,

And Ms. BARRETT speaking at 5:00 p.m.,

The debate was allowed to remain in her name and, by leave, in the names of Messrs. REID and SANTOS.

---

Mr. EVANS (Brandon East) moved:

Resolution No. 16 - Role of the Bank of Canada in Holding Federal Debt

WHEREAS the purpose of the Bank of Canada is to control and protect the external value of the monetary unit and to mitigate fluctuations in the general level of production, trade prices and employment - in other words a balance between employment and inflation; and

WHEREAS the Federal Government can control domestic interest rates through the actions of the Bank of Canada; and

WHEREAS the Bank of Canada has abandoned its mandate to seek a balance between employment and price stability in favour of extremely low interest rates, which in turn has caused unsustainable real interest rates and high levels of real unemployment; and

**Wednesday, April 22, 1998**

---

WHEREAS Canadian interest rates were higher than in other industrialized countries between 1989 and 1993 as a result of the priority attached by the Bank of Canada to the fight against inflation; and

WHEREAS the Bank of Canada reduced the proportion of federal bonds that it traditionally held, thereby lessening its ability to affect long-term interest rates; and

WHEREAS the holdings of government debt by the Bank of Canada represent the credit extended by the Bank to the Government; and

WHEREAS the Bank of Canada Act allows the Bank to purchase Provincial Government bonds, if directed by the Federal Government; and

WHEREAS the Bank of Canada could significantly ease the burden of interest on the public debt by holding a larger portion of the Federal Government debt, as occurred during World War II and the early post-war years; and

WHEREAS the Bank collects interest on the debt paid by the Government, but because the Government owns the Bank, those interest payments are returned as "profit" paid by the Bank of Canada on its yearly operations; and

WHEREAS the Bank of Canada is highly profitable, returning to the Government upwards of \$2 billion per year; and

WHEREAS the 1993 changes to the Bank Act completely eliminated the requirement for chartered banks to deposit any reserves with the Bank of Canada, thereby conferring billions of dollars of increased annual profits on the chartered banks.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Legislative Assembly of Manitoba urge the Federal Government to immediately implement a policy whereby the Bank of Canada would acquire more Canadian government debt, both federal and provincial; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that this Assembly urge the Federal Government to maintain a low interest rate policy through the Bank of Canada, thereby reducing the burden of interest rate payments on the debt, allowing the federal government to restore and maintain cash transfers to the provinces.

**Wednesday, April 22, 1998**

---

And a debate arising,

And Mr. EVANS (Brandon East), Hon. Mr. GILLESHAMMER, Messrs. ASHTON and McALPINE having spoken,

The debate was allowed to remain open.

---

The House then adjourned at 6:00 p.m. until 10:00 a.m. tomorrow.

Hon. Louise Dacquay,  
Speaker.